

Message Text

PAGE 01 STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037
ORIGIN NODS-00

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 /001 R

DRAFTED BY S/P:DKORN/NEA:MSTERNER/INR:PSTODDARD
APPROVED BY NEA: ALATHERTON
NEA: M STERNER
INR: H H SAUNDERS
S/S - FWISNER

-----090007 080338Z /62
O 080145Z DEC 77 ZFF4
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO USDEL SECRETARY IMMEDIATE

S E C R E T STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037

NODIS
CHEROKEE

E.O. 11652: XGDS-2

TAGS: IS, EG, PFOR

SUBJECT: INR/NEA MIDDLE EAST ASSESSMENT

1. FOLLOWING FOR THE SECRETARY'S CONSIDERATION IS A JOINT
INR/NEA ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPLICATIONS FOR THE US IF
SADAT PURSUES A BILATERAL PEACE AGREEMENT WITH ISRAEL.

2. BEGIN TEXT: THIS PAPER, UNDERTAKEN IN CONSULTATION
WITH SEVERAL OF OUR AMBASSADORS IN THE MIDDLE EAST AND
IN MOSCOW, EXAMINES THE IMPLICATIONS OF A POSSIBLE
DECISION BY PRESIDENT SADAT TO SEEK A BILATERAL PEACE
AGREEMENT WITH ISRAEL. SINCE EVENTS COULD WELL EVOLVE
IN SUCH A WAY THAT WE MIGHT BE CONFRONTED BY SUCH A
SEPARATE AGREEMENT, IT SEEMS PRUDENT TO RE-EXAMINE THE
PROPOSITION THAT NO ARAB GOVERNMENT COULD MAKE A SEPARATE
SECRET

PAGE 02 STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037

PEACE WITH ISRAEL AND SURVIVE, AND ALSO TO ASSESS THE
IMPLICATIONS OF SUCH A DEVELOPMENT FOR US INTERESTS IN
THE MIDDLE EAST.

3. FOR THE SAKE OF ANALYSIS, IT IS USEFUL TO KEEP IN
MIND TWO PATHS BY WHICH SADAT MIGHT DECIDE TO SEEK A
SEPARATE AGREEMENT:

(1) HE COULD TRY TO NEGOTIATE A COMPREHENSIVE SETTLEMENT,
AS HE HAS SAID HE WILL DO, AND RECEIVE FROM ISRAEL

CONCESSIONS HE REGARDS AS SUFFICIENT TO ENABLE HIM TO URGE THE OTHER CONFRONTATION STATES AND THE PALESTINIANS TO JOIN THE NEGOTIATING PROCESS. IF THEY REFUSE TO DO SO, HE COULD THEN PROCEED WITH A BILATERAL AGREEMENT, CLAIMING THAT THE OTHER ARAB PARTIES HAD MISSED THE OPPORTUNITY HE HAD OPENED FOR THEM AND EXPRESSING THE HOPE THAT THEY WOULD JOIN HIM AT A LATER DATE.

(2) HE COULD MAKE AN EFFORT TO ACHIEVE A COMPREHENSIVE SETTLEMENT BUT, RECEIVING TOO LITTLE FROM ISRAEL EXCEPT IN THE SINAI, MOVE AHEAD WITH AN EGYPT-ISRAEL AGREEMENT.

4. SHOULD SADAT PURSUE A GENUINELY SEPARATE AGREEMENT, THE IMPACT BOTH WITHIN EGYPT AND THE ARAB WORLD AS A WHOLE WOULD DEPEND LARGELY ON WHICH OF THESE TWO PATHS HAD BEEN FOLLOWED, I.E., WHETHER HE HAD BEEN ABLE TO OBTAIN PLAUSIBLE CONCESSIONS FROM ISRAEL ON THE OTHER FRONTS. THE ESSENCE OF HIS STRATEGY MUST BE THIS: HE CAN AFFORD IF NECESSARY TO LEAVE SYRIA OUT IF THE SYRIANS PROVE DIFFICULT PROVIDING HE CAN SHOW SOMETHING FOR THE PALESTINIANS. THUS THE PALESTINIANS, PARTICULARLY BECAUSE OF SAUDI CONCERN FOR THEIR FATE, BECOME THE CRUX OF HIS STRATEGY. HE HAS THUS INSISTED THAT FIRST PRIORITY BE
SECRET

PAGE 03 STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037

GIVEN TO THE PALESTINIAN ISSUE, AND IF HE COULD OBTAIN ISRAELI AGREEMENT ULTIMATELY TO WITHDRAW FROM THE WEST BANK, HE WOULD HAVE IN HAND THE MAIN ELEMENT OF A COMPREHENSIVE SETTLEMENT. IF SYRIA THEN REFUSED TO NEGOTIATE, AND IF NO PALESTINIAN NEGOTIATOR PROVED WILLING, SADAT COULD THEN EITHER TRY TO INVOLVE JORDAN IN A WEST BANK SETTLEMENT OR CLAIM THAT HE HAD DONE EVERYTHING POSSIBLE FOR PEACE AND MOVE TO A SEPARATE AGREEMENT. THIS SCENARIO, HOWEVER, WOULD BE DEPENDENT ON ISRAELI WILLINGNESS TO MAKE CONCESSIONS REGARDING THE WEST BANK.

5. SADAT MUST ALSO CONCERN HIMSELF WITH HIS ABILITY TO SURMOUNT WHATEVER DOMESTIC OPPOSITION MIGHT BE GENERATED IN EGYPT BY A MOVE TOWARD A SEPARATE DEAL. THE DEGREE TO WHICH THIS OPPOSITION WOULD BE LIKELY TO INFECT THE ARMED FORCES AND THUS ENDANGER HIS REGIME WOULD AGAIN DEPEND LARGELY ON WHAT HAD PRECEDED HIS DECISION TO SEEK A BILATERAL AGREEMENT. IN ESSENCE, OUR JUDGMENT AT THIS POINT IS THAT IF SADAT CAN SHOW HE HAS RECEIVED CONCESSIONS FROM ISRAEL THAT ARE MEANINGFUL IN A PAN-ARAB CONTEXT, ESPECIALLY AS REGARDS THE PALESTINIAN ISSUE, AND IF SYRIA AND REPRESENTATIVE PALESTINIANS REFUSE TO JOIN THE NEGOTIATIONS, SADAT COULD PROBABLY JUSTIFY TO THE EGYPTIAN PEOPLE AND THE MILITARY LEADERSHIP AN ATTEMPT TO STRIKE A SEPARATE DEAL. IN THE ABSENCE OF SUCH ISRAELI CONCESSIONS, THE ABILITY OF ANY GOVERNMENT IN CAIRO TO ADHERE OVER THE LONG-TERM TO A SEPARATE AGREEMENT IN THE

FACE OF EXTERNAL AND INTERNAL OPPOSITION MUST BE DEEMED
FAR MORE PROBLEMATICAL.

6. THE US MUST CONCERN ITSELF NOT ONLY WITH THE PROBABLE
EFFECT OF A SEPARATE DEAL ON THE SADAT REGIME, BUT ALSO
WITH ITS IMPACT ON THE STABILITY OF THE MIDDLE EAST AS A
WHOLE. THERE ARE STRONG ARGUMENTS IN SUPPORT OF THE PRO-
POSITION THAT A SEPARATE DEAL WOULD HAVE A DISRUPTIVE
EFFECT ON BOTH FRONTS, THOUGH THIS WOULD BE AMELIORATED
SECRET

PAGE 04 STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037

IN EGYPT AND AMONG MODERATE ARABS IF SADAT HAD ACHIEVED
PERCEPTIBLE ISRAELI FLEXIBILITY ON PAN-ARAB ISSUES WHICH
SYRIA AND THE PLO THEN REJECTED:

-- IT WOULD NOT BY ITSELF BRING PEACE TO THE MIDDLE EAST.
THE ARAB-ISRAELI CONFLICT WOULD REMAIN A FOCAL POINT
OF SERIOUS INSTABILITY BOTH BECAUSE ISRAEL WOULD BE
THE TARGET OF ATTACK AND BECAUSE RIVAL ARAB FACTIONS
WOULD USE THE ISSUE TO ATTACK EACH OTHER. WHILE THAT
INSTABILITY REMAINS, EGYPT WILL REMAIN UNDER PRESSURE
TO RENEGE ON ITS AGREEMENT, ESPECIALLY UNDER POST-SADAT
LEADERSHIP.

-- WHILE THE REJECTIONISTS WOULD HAVE LIMITED CAPACITY TO
THREATEN ISRAEL IN THE NEAR FUTURE, SYRIA MIGHT JOIN
FORCES IRREVOCABLY WITH THE REJECTIONISTS AND COULD
TRY TO RECONSTITUTE THE "NORTHERN TIER" OVER TIME AS
A CREDIBLE MILITARY FORCE WITH WHICH TO RECOVER THE
GOLAN HEIGHTS. SUCH A GROUPING MIGHT BE APPEALING TO
SAUDI ARABIA AS AN ALTERNATIVE, IN TERMS OF POLITICAL
AND MILITARY GRAVITY, TO CONTINUED SUPPORT FOR EGYPT.

-- RADICAL ELEMENTS AMONG THE REJECTIONISTS MIGHT UNDER-
TAKE A CAMPAIGN AGAINST MODERATE ARAB REGIMES WHICH
WOULD AT LEAST FOMENT POPULAR DISCONTENT AND COULD
LEAD TO THEIR REPLACEMENT BY MORE RADICAL GOVERNMENTS.
THIS PRESSURE MIGHT FOCUS FIRST ON JORDAN AS A NECES-
SARY BASE FOR ACCELERATED PALESTINIAN EFFORTS TO
REGAIN THE WEST BANK BY FORCE. SOUTHERN LEBANON
WOULD BE FURTHER DEVELOPED AS A BASE FOR STRIKING
ISRAEL.

-- THE SOVIET UNION, LACKING ANY FURTHER NEED TO PROTECT
SECRET

PAGE 05 STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037

ITS STAKE IN A GENEVA CONFERENCE OR ANY PROSPECT OF A
REASONABLE RELATIONSHIP WITH MODERATE ARABS, WOULD
BE FREE TO ENCOURAGE REGIONAL INSTABILITY AND WOULD
UTILIZE REJECTIONIST ELEMENTS TO THAT END.

--A SPLIT IN THE ARAB WORLD BETWEEN REJECTIONISTS AND EGYPT COULD PROVIDE A POTENT RALLYING POINT FOR SADAT'S DOMESTIC OPPONENTS. DEPENDING ON THEIR STRENGTH, THEY COULD HAMPER SADAT'S OR ANY SUCCESSOR'S ABILITY TO FOLLOW THROUGH IN DEVELOPING THE KIND OF RELATIONSHIP ISRAEL WILL DEMAND.

--THE EGYPTIAN ECONOMY COULD WELL LOSE THE SUBSIDIES FROM SAUDI ARABIA ON WHICH IT HAS BECOME DEPENDENT. THE US WOULD BE EXPECTED, IN ADDITION TO PRESENT AID LEVELS, TO PICK UP MUCH OF THE SLACK.

--THE US, IF IT SUPPORTED AN ISRAEL-EGYPT AGREEMENT, WOULD FIND ITSELF ISOLATED FROM MOST OTHER ARAB STATES FOR SOME PERIOD OF TIME.

7. THERE ARE ALSO STRONG ARGUMENTS ON THE OTHER SIDE WHICH BOIL DOWN TO THE IDEA THAT AN EGYPTIAN-ISRAELI-SAUDI-US COALITION WILL PROVE TOO STRONG FOR REJECTIONIST FORCES TO OVERCOME, AND THAT THIS WILL, OVER TIME, FORCE THE OTHER PARTIES TO MAKE THEIR OWN DEALS WITH ISRAEL.

--THE SAUDIS WOULD BE MOST RELUCTANT TO SUPPORT A REJECTIONIST COALITION BECAUSE OF ITS ULTIMATE THREAT TO SAUDI STABILITY AND WOULD WISH TO SUPPORT SADAT LEST HE BE REPLACED BY A RADICAL REGIME IN CAIRO.

--THE SYRIANS, CONFRONTED BY THE PROSPECT OF BEARING THE FULL BRUNT OF ANY HOSTILITIES WITH ISRAEL, WOULD JOIN A REJECTIONIST COALITION ONLY WITH THE GREATEST SECRET

PAGE 06 STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037

RELUCTANCE. ASSAD'S MAIN OBJECTION TO SADAT'S COURSE IS THAT SYRIA CANNOT HOPE TO REGAIN ITS TERRITORY OR WIN GAINS FOR THE PALESTINIANS BY ITSELF.

--THE PLO BY ITSELF IS IMPOTENT, ALTHOUGH THERE COULD BE A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN TERRORISM.

--THE SOVIET UNION IS NOT EAGER FOR AN INCREASE IN TENSIONS IN THE MIDDLE EAST WHICH COULD LEAD TO RENEWED HOSTILITIES AND ARE CONCERNED LEST A POLITICAL CONFRONTATION WITH THE US IN THAT REGION EFFECT OTHER ASPECTS OF THE US-SOVIET RELATIONSHIP.

--DIFFERENCES AMONG THE REJECTIONIST STATES -- SUCH AS THE RIVALRY BETWEEN THE COMPETING WINGS OF THE BAATH PARTIES IN SYRIA AND IRAQ -- MAY BE DEEP ENOUGH TO PREVENT THEIR EFFECTIVE COOPERATION EVEN UNDER THE PROVOCATION OF A SEPARATE AGREEMENT.

8. ANALYTICALLY, THE LIKELIHOOD OF A REJECTIONIST FRONT COALESCING AGAINST SADAT AND DISRUPTING REGIONAL STABILITY DEPENDS IN THE FIRST INSTANCE ON SYRIA'S DECISION TO PARTICIPATE. ASSAD THUS FAR SEEMS TO BE TEMPORIZING, WANTING NEITHER TO FOLLOW SADAT'S LEAD NOR TO JOIN FORCES WITH IRAQ AND LIBYA. IF SADAT CAN OBTAIN TANGIBLE CONCESSIONS FROM ISRAEL FOR EITHER THE PALESTINIANS OR SYRIA, IT WILL BE MUCH MORE DIFFICULT FOR ASSAD TO KEEP OUT OF THE NEGOTIATING PROCESS.

9. THE ULTIMATE SYRIAN POSITION, AS WELL AS THE POSITIONS OF SEVERAL OTHER ARAB STATES, WILL DEPEND LARGELY ON THE POSTURE OF SAUDI ARABIA. WHILE THE SAUDIS HAVE MADE CLEAR THEY ARE CONTINUING THEIR FINANCIAL SUPPORT FOR EGYPT, THEY COULD MOVE TO CURTAIL THAT SUPPORT
SECRET

PAGE 07 STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037

IF SADAT SHOULD SEEK A SEPARATE DEAL. THEIR POSITION MIGHT WELL BE DIFFERENT, HOWEVER, SHOULD SYRIA AND APPROPRIATE PALESTINIANS, GIVEN A CHANCE TO NEGOTIATE WITH AN ISRAEL PERCEIVED AS READY TO MAKE SERIOUS CONCESSIONS, FAIL TO SEIZE THE OPPORTUNITY. THUS THE CRUCIAL ELEMENT IN SAUDI CALCULATIONS IS THE WILLINGNESS OF ISRAEL TO OFFER CONCESSIONS APPLICABLE TO SYRIA AND THE PALESTINIANS. WITHOUT SUCH CONCESSIONS, SAUDI PRESSURE ON SYRIA AND THE PALESTINIANS TO JOIN THE PEACE PROCESS WILL PROBABLY NOT OCCUR.

10. IMPLICATIONS FOR THE US. AN EGYPT-ISRAEL SETTLEMENT AGAINST THE BACKGROUND OF A DEEP SPLIT BETWEEN EGYPT AND THE REJECTIONISTS WOULD, ON BALANCE, BE BETTER FROM THE US VIEWPOINT, IF SADAT CAN WEATHER THE STORM, THAN A CONTINUING NEGOTIATING IMPASSE. EVEN IN A TURBULENT MIDDLE EAST THE US WOULD HAVE PRESERVED ITS FUNDAMENTAL INTEREST IF IT WERE, IN EFFECT, ASSOCIATED WITH A COALITION OF ISRAEL, EGYPT, AND SAUDI ARABIA. WE DO NOT HAVE THAT MUCH AT STAKE IN THE OTHER MIDDLE EAST STATES THEMSELVES PROVIDED TURBULENCE THERE DOES NOT EITHER LEAD TO WAR OR OTHER CONDITIONS THAT FORCE THE MODERATES INTO A MORE RADICAL STANCE AS IT DID SAUDI ARABIA WITH THE OIL EMBARGO IN 1973-74 OR UNSEAT THEM. HOWEVER, A SEPARATE PEACE PROCESS WOULD RESOLVE FEW PROBLEMS AND LEAVE CONSIDERABLE INSTABILITY, AND ITS MAIN VALUE TO US WOULD BE AS A BREAKTHROUGH WHICH MIGHT LEAD THE WAY TO FURTHER AGREEMENTS ON OTHER FRONTS.

11. FROM THIS ANALYSIS EMERGE TWO POINTS:

(A) FIRST: WITHOUT DENIGRATING THE SADAT INITIATIVE, WE HAVE A CLEAR INTEREST--AS DOES SADAT HIMSELF-- IN ADHERING CLOSELY TO THE THEME THAT OUR OBJECTIVE REMAINS A COMPREHENSIVE PEACE SETTLEMENT AND THAT WE WELCOME ALL

SECRET

PAGE 08 STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037

CONTACTS AMONG THE PARTIES THAT CONSTITUTE STEPS ALONG THAT ROUTE. IN THAT CONTEXT, WE SHOULD AVOID BEING DRAWN INTO A PUBLIC POSTURE OF RULING OUT A SEPARATE AGREEMENT. TO THE EXTENT THAT SADAT IS PERCEIVED AS DETERMINED TO CONTINUE DOWN THE NEGOTIATING PATH WITH ISRAEL AND AS ENJOYING BROAD DOMESTIC AND INTERNATIONAL SUPPORT, SOME PRESSURE WILL BE GENERATED FOR THE SYRIANS AND PALESTINIANS TO REASSESS THEIR ANTI-SADAT POSITIONS. BUT WE SHOULD ALSO AVOID STATEMENTS THAT MIGHT BE INTERPRETED AS FORESHADOWING THAT THE US HAS ALREADY DECIDED TO SUPPORT A SEPARATE AGREEMENT. THE SOVIETS, THE SYRIANS, AND THE RADICAL ARABS ALL SUSPECT THAT WE ARE CONSPIRING WITH SADAT AND THE ISRAELIS TO BRING ABOUT A SEPARATE PEACE. SUCH SUSPICIONS CAN ONLY MAKE MATTERS MORE DIFFICULT FOR SADAT, EVEN THOUGH HE TENDS TO MINIMIZE THESE CONSIDERATIONS FOR THE MOMENT. IN OUR PRIVATE DIPLOMACY, WE SHOULD COMPORT OURSELVES IN A WAY THAT WILL NOT RESTRICT SADAT'S FREEDOM OF ACTION. WE SHOULD CONTINUE TO KEEP OUR CHANNELS OPEN TO THE SYRIANS AND THE SOVIETS, BUT WE SHOULD NOT BE WILLING TO PAY MUCH OF A PRICE FOR GETTING THEM BACK INTO THE NEGOTIATIONS AT THIS STAGE IF THINGS ARE MOVING ON THE EGYPTIAN-ISRAELI TRACK.

(B) SECOND: WE MUST KEEP IN MIND THAT AS SADAT PURSUES HIS NEGOTIATING STRATEGY THE US AND ISRAELI VIEWPOINT WILL NOT CONCLUDE IN ALL RESPECTS. WHILE MANY ISRAELIS PAY LIP SERVICE TO THE GOAL OF A COMPREHENSIVE PEACE, THE PREVAILING STRATEGIC ASSESSMENT WITHIN ISRAEL IS LIKELY TO BE THAT IT IS IN ISRAEL'S INTEREST TO TAKE THE BIGGEST ARAB POWER OUT OF THE STRUGGLE AND TO LET THE CONFRONTATION CONTINUE WITH THE LESS POWERFUL ARABS. IN OTHER WORDS, THE REGIONAL CONDITIONS OF TURBULENCE

SECRET

PAGE 09 STATE 292678 TOSEC 120037

PRODUCED BY A SEPARATE EGYPT-ISRAEL PEACE WOULD BE OF LESS CONCERN TO ISRAEL THAN TO THE US. WHERE ISRAELI AND US INTERESTS DO COINCIDE, HOWEVER, IS IN THE FOLLOWING PROPOSITION: WHETHER OR NOT SADAT CAN PROCEED TO A BILATERAL AGREEMENT WHICH HAS REASONABLE PROSPECTS OF SURVIVING INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL PRESSURES WILL DEPEND IN LARGE MEASURE ON HIS GETTING FROM ISRAEL PLAUSIBLE CONCESSIONS ON THE OTHER FRONTS. THE ISRAELIS WILL AGREE THESE WILL BE DESIRABLE, BUT IN THE END MAY WELL TAKE THE POSITION THAT EGYPT'S DESPERATE CIRCUMSTANCES WILL DRIVE SADAT TO A BILATERAL AGREEMENT IF NOTHING ELSE IS AVAILABLE. THIS COULD TURN OUT TO BE TRUE, BUT TO

COUNT ON IT WOULD BE PLAYING A LONG-SHOT, AND OUR OWN
POLICY INTERESTS DICTATE THAT WE DISPUTE THIS ASSESSMENT
WITH THE ISRAELIS. CHRISTOPHER

SECRET

<< END OF DOCUMENT >>

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: Z
Capture Date: 22-Sep-1999 12:00:00 am
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: TOSEC, POLITICAL SETTLEMENT, INTELLIGENCE ASSESSMENTS, CAT-B,
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Sent Date: 08-Dec-1977 12:00:00 am
Decaption Date: 22 May 2009
Decaption Note: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 22 May 2009
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977STATE292678
Document Source: ADS
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: S/P:DKORN/NEA:MSTERNER/INR:PSTODDARD
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: 11652 XGDS-2
Errors: n/a
Expiration:
Film Number: P840072-1233
Format: TEL
From: STATE
Handling Restrictions:
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t197712111/baaaeuph.tel
Line Count: 331
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, TEXT ON MICROFILM
Message ID: 51f45dfc-c188-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ORIGIN SS
Original Classification: SECRET
Original Handling Restrictions: NODIS
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 7
Previous Channel Indicators:
Previous Classification: SECRET
Previous Handling Restrictions: NODIS
Reference: n/a
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 16-Mar-2005 12:00:00 am
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 119268
Secure: LOCK1
Status: NATIVE
Subject: INR/NEA MIDDLE EAST ASSESSMENT
TAGS: PFOR, PBOR, PDEV, IS, EG, XF
To: SECRETARY
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odb://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/51f45dfc-c188-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
22 May 2009
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009